

# Multi-objective Intuitionistic Fuzzy Linear Programming model for optimization of industrial closed-loop supply chain network

Kousar, S.<sup>a</sup>, Batool, M.<sup>a</sup>, Kausar, N.<sup>b</sup>, Pamucar, D.<sup>c</sup>, Ozbilge, E.<sup>d,\*</sup>, Tantay, B.<sup>d</sup>

<sup>a</sup>International Islamic University Islamabad, Department of Mathematics and Statistics, Pakistan

<sup>b</sup>Yildiz Technical University, Faculty of Arts and Sciences, Department of Mathematics, Istanbul, Turkey

<sup>c</sup>University of Belgrade, Faculty of Organizational Sciences, Belgrade, Serbia

<sup>d</sup>American University of the Middle East, Department of Mathematics and Statistics, Egaila, Kuwait

## ABSTRACT

The urge to remanufacture and address environmental concerns in various industrial processes has drawn the attention of academics as well as practitioners towards Closed-loop Supply Chain Networks (CLSC). Although ever-changing and complex external factors including social and economic ones, adversely impact the sustainable development of closed-loop supply chain networks. The basic aim of the research is to optimize the functioning of CLSC networks. For the above-said, two objective functions are made. The first objective is to minimize the cost of production and assembly expenses of the forward and reverse logistics. Secondly, an endeavour has been made to reduce the fixed costs associated with plants and retailers. For the sake of achieving two objective functions, two methods are employed: triangular fuzzy numbers and triangular intuitionistic fuzzy numbers. Among the two methods, triangular intuitionistic fuzzy numbers achieved the said objectives with greater optimization substantiated by statistics. This method can deal with uncertain external factors without undermining the optimization of the CLSC networks.

## ARTICLE INFO

### Keywords:

Supply chain;  
Closed-loop supply chain;  
Multi-objective linear programming;  
Modelling;  
Optimization;  
Fuzzy logic;  
Intuitionistic fuzzy numbers

### \*Corresponding author:

[ebru.kahveci@aum.edu.kw](mailto:ebru.kahveci@aum.edu.kw)  
(Ozbilge, E.)

### Article history:

Received 7 March 2022

Revised 12 September 2022

Accepted 17 September 2022



Content from this work may be used under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International Licence (CC BY 4.0). Any further distribution of this work must maintain attribution to the author(s) and the title of the work, journal citation and DOI.

## References

- [1] Zhang, H., Ren, Y., Sui, Y., Qi, J., Wei, F. (2020). Recycle of industrial waste: A new method of applying the paint residue to supercapacitors, *Journal of Materials Science: Materials in Electronics*, Vol. 31, 274-285, [doi: 10.1007/s10854-019-02488-2](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10854-019-02488-2).
- [2] Rubinos, D.A., Spagnoli, G. (2018). Utilization of waste products as alternative landfill liner and cover materials—A critical review, *Critical Reviews in Environmental Science and Technology*, Vol. 48, No. 4, 376-438, [doi: 10.1080/10643389.2018.1461495](https://doi.org/10.1080/10643389.2018.1461495).
- [3] Wu, J., Zhu, Q., Chu, J., Liang, L. (2015). Two-stage network structures with undesirable intermediate outputs reused: A DEA based approach, *Computational Economics*, Vol. 46, 455-477, [doi: 10.1007/s10614-015-9498-3](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10614-015-9498-3).
- [4] Sarkar, B., Ullah, M., Sarkar, M. (2022). Environmental and economic sustainability through innovative green products by remanufacturing, *Journal of Cleaner Production*, Vol. 332, Article No. 129813, [doi: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2021.129813](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2021.129813).

- [5] Savaskan, R.C., Bhattacharya, S., Van Wassenhove, L.N. (2004). Closed-loop supply chain models with product remanufacturing, *Management Science*, Vol. 50, No. 2, 239-252, [doi: 10.1287/mnsc.1030.0186](https://doi.org/10.1287/mnsc.1030.0186).
- [5] Hugos, M. (2018). *Essentials of supply chain management*, Fourth edition, John Wiley & Sons, Hoboken, New Jersey, USA, [doi: 10.1002/9781119464495](https://doi.org/10.1002/9781119464495).
- [7] Özceylan, E., Paksoy, T. (2013). A mixed integer programming model for a closed-loop supply-chain network, *International Journal of Production Research*, Vol. 5, No. 3, 718-734, [doi: 10.1080/00207543.2012.661090](https://doi.org/10.1080/00207543.2012.661090).
- [8] Aleksić, A., Runić Ristić, M., Komatina, N., Tadić, D. (2019). Advanced risk assessment in reverse supply chain processes: A case study in Republic of Serbia, *Advances in Production Engineering & Management*, Vol. 14, No. 4, 421-434, [doi: 10.14743/apem2019.4.338](https://doi.org/10.14743/apem2019.4.338).
- [9] Jindal, A., Sangwan, K.S. (2014). Closed loop supply chain network design and optimisation using fuzzy mixed integer linear programming model, *International Journal of Production Research*, Vol. 52, No. 14, 4156-4173, [doi: 10.1080/00207543.2013.861948](https://doi.org/10.1080/00207543.2013.861948).
- [10] Garcia, D.J., You, F. (2015). Supply chain design and optimization: Challenges and opportunities, *Computers & Chemical Engineering*, Vol. 81, 153-170, [doi: 10.1016/j.compchemeng.2015.03.015](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compchemeng.2015.03.015).
- [11] Fang, I.W., Lin, W.-T. (2021). A multi-objective optimal decision model for a green closed-loop supply chain under uncertainty: A real industrial case study, *Advances in Production Engineering & Management*, Vol. 16, No. 2, 161-172, [doi: 10.14743/apem2021.2.391](https://doi.org/10.14743/apem2021.2.391).
- [12] Özceylan, E., Paksoy, T. (2013). Fuzzy multi-objective linear programming approach for optimising a closed-loop supply chain network, *International Journal of Production Research*, Vol. 51, No. 8, 2443-2461, [doi: 10.1080/00207543.2012.740579](https://doi.org/10.1080/00207543.2012.740579).
- [13] Liu, Z., Li, K.W., Li, B.-Y., Huang, J., Tang, J. (2019). Impact of product-design strategies on the operations of a closed-loop supply chain, *Transportation Research Part E: Logistics and Transportation Review*, Vol. 124, 75-91, [doi: 10.1016/j.tre.2019.02.007](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tre.2019.02.007).
- [14] Tsao, Y.-C., Thanh, V.-V., Lu, J.-C., Yu, V. (2018). Designing sustainable supply chain networks under uncertain environments: Fuzzy multi-objective programming, *Journal of Cleaner Production*, Vol. 174, 1550-1565, [doi: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2017.10.272](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2017.10.272).
- [15] Govindan, K., Darbari, J.D., Agarwal, V., Jha, P.C. (2017). Fuzzy multi-objective approach for optimal selection of suppliers and transportation decisions in an eco-efficient closed loop supply chain network, *Journal of Cleaner Production*, Vol. 165, 1598-1619, [doi: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2017.06.180](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2017.06.180).
- [16] Duan, W., Ma, H., Xu, D.S. (2021). Analysis of the impact of COVID-19 on the coupling of the material flow and capital flow in a closed-loop supply chain, *Advances in Production Engineering & Management*, Vol. 16, No. 1, 5-22, [doi: 10.14743/apem2021.1.381](https://doi.org/10.14743/apem2021.1.381).
- [17] Zhou, L., Xie, J., Gu, X., Lin, Y., Ieromonachou, P., Zhang, X. (2016). Forecasting return of used products for remanufacturing using Graphical Evaluation and Review Technique (GERT), *International Journal of Production Economics*, Vol. 181, Part B, 315-324, [doi: 10.1016/j.ijpe.2016.04.016](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijpe.2016.04.016).
- [18] Zadeh, L.A. (1965). Fuzzy sets, *Information and Control*, Vol. 8, No. 3, 338-353, [doi: 10.1016/S0019-9958\(65\)90241-X](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0019-9958(65)90241-X).
- [19] Atanassov, K.T. (1986). Intuitionistic fuzzy sets, *Fuzzy Sets and Systems*, Vol. 20, No. 1, 87-96, [doi: 10.1016/S0165-0114\(86\)80034-3](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0165-0114(86)80034-3).
- [20] Zimmermann, H.-J. (1975). Description and optimization of fuzzy systems, *International Journal of General Systems*, Vol. 2, No. 1, 209-215, [doi: 10.1080/03081077508960870](https://doi.org/10.1080/03081077508960870).
- [21] Ghanbari, R., Ghorbani-Moghadam, K., Mahdavi-Amiri, N., De Baets, B. (2020). Fuzzy linear programming problems: Models and solutions, *Soft Computing*, Vol. 24, 10043-10073, [doi: 10.1007/s00500-019-04519-w](https://doi.org/10.1007/s00500-019-04519-w).
- [22] Seikh, M.R., Nayak, P.K., Pal, M. (2012). Generalized triangular fuzzy numbers in intuitionistic fuzzy environment, *International Journal of Engineering Research and Development*, Vol. 5, No. 1, 8-13.
- [23] Fullér, R. (1991). On product-sum of triangular fuzzy number, *Fuzzy Sets and Systems*, Vol. 41, No. 1, 83-87, [doi: 10.1016/0165-0114\(91\)90158-M](https://doi.org/10.1016/0165-0114(91)90158-M).
- [24] Shaw, A.K., Roy, T.K. (2012). Some arithmetic operations on triangular intuitionistic fuzzy number and its application on reliability evaluation, *International Journal of Fuzzy Mathematics and Systems*, Vol. 2, No. 4, 363-382.
- [25] Eiselt, H.A., Sandblom, C.-L. (2007). *Linear programming and its applications*, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany, [doi: 10.1007/978-3-540-73671-4](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-540-73671-4).
- [26] Chanas, S. (1989). Fuzzy programming in multiobjective linear programming – A parametric approach, *Fuzzy Sets and Systems*, Vol. 29, No. 3, 303-313, [doi: 10.1016/0165-0114\(89\)90042-0](https://doi.org/10.1016/0165-0114(89)90042-0).
- [27] Zimmermann, H.-J. (1978). Fuzzy programming and linear programming with several objective functions, *Fuzzy Sets and Systems*, Vol. 1, No. 1, 45-55, [doi: 10.1016/0165-0114\(78\)90031-3](https://doi.org/10.1016/0165-0114(78)90031-3).
- [28] Schultmann, F., Zumkeller, M., Rentz, O. (2006). Modeling reverse logistic tasks within closed-loop supply chains: An example from the automotive industry, *European Journal of Operational Research*, Vol. 171, No. 3, 1033-1050, [doi: 10.1016/j.ejor.2005.01.016](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ejor.2005.01.016).