

# A comparative study of different pull control strategies in multi-product manufacturing systems using discrete event simulation

Xanthopoulos, A.S.<sup>a,\*</sup>, Koulouriotis, D.E.<sup>b</sup>

<sup>a,b</sup>Department of Production and Management Engineering, Democritus University of Thrace, V. Sofias 12, Xanthi, Greece

## ABSTRACT

Pull production control strategies coordinate manufacturing operations based on actual demand. Up to now, relevant publications mostly examine manufacturing systems that produce a single type of a product. In this research, we examine the CONWIP, Base Stock, and CONWIP/Kanban Hybrid pull strategies in multi-product manufacturing systems. In a multi-product manufacturing system, several types of products are manufactured by utilizing the same resources. We develop queueing network models of multi-stage, multi-product manufacturing systems operating under the three aforementioned pull control strategies. Simulation models of the alternative production systems are implemented using an open-source software. A comparative evaluation of CONWIP, Base Stock and CONWIP/Kanban Hybrid in multi-product manufacturing is carried out in a series of simulation experiments with varying demand arrival rates, setup times and control parameters. The control strategies are compared based on average wait time of backordered demand, average finished products inventories, and average length of backorders queues. The Base Stock strategy excels when the manufacturing system is subjected to high demand arrival rates. The CONWIP strategy produced consistently the highest level of finished goods inventories. The CONWIP/Kanban Hybrid strategy is significantly affected by the workload that is imposed on the system.

## ARTICLE INFO

### Keywords:

Discrete event simulation (DES);  
Open-source software;  
JaamSim DES software;  
Multi-product manufacturing;  
Multi-stage production systems;  
Pull-type production control strategies

### \*Corresponding author:

[axanthop@pme.duth.gr](mailto:axanthop@pme.duth.gr)  
(Xanthopoulos, A.S.)

### Article history:

Received 17 September 2021

Revised 30 November 2021

Accepted 3 December 2021



Content from this work may be used under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License (CC BY 4.0). Any further distribution of this work must maintain attribution to the author(s) and the title of the work, journal citation and DOI.

## References

- [1] Puchkova, A., Le Romancer, J., McFarlane, D. (2016). Balancing push and pull strategies within the production system, *IFAC-PapersOnLine*, Vol. 49, No. 2, 66-71, [doi: 10.1016/j.ifacol.2016.03.012](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ifacol.2016.03.012).
- [2] Liberopoulos, G. (2013). Production release control: Paced, WIP-based or demand driven? Revisiting the push/pull and make-to-order/make-to-stock distinctions, In: Smith, J., Tan, B. (eds.), *Handbook of stochastic models and analysis of manufacturing system operations*, International Series in Operations Research & Management Science, Vol. 192, Springer, New York, USA, 211-247, [doi: 10.1007/978-1-4614-6777-9\\_7](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4614-6777-9_7).
- [3] Koulouriotis, D.E., Xanthopoulos, A.S., Tourassis, V.D. (2010). Simulation optimization of pull control policies for serial manufacturing lines and assembly manufacturing systems using genetic algorithms, *International Journal of Production Research*, Vol. 48, No. 10, 2887-2912, [doi: 10.1080/00207540802603759](https://doi.org/10.1080/00207540802603759).
- [4] Xanthopoulos, A.S., Koulouriotis, D.E. (2014). Multi-objective optimization of production control mechanisms for multi-stage serial manufacturing-inventory systems, *International Journal of Advanced Manufacturing Technology*, Vol. 74, 1507-1519, [doi: 10.1007/s00170-014-6052-8](https://doi.org/10.1007/s00170-014-6052-8).
- [5] Xanthopoulos, A.S., Koulouriotis, D.E., Gasteratos, A. (2017). Adaptive card-based production control policies, *Computers & Industrial Engineering*, Vol. 103, 131-144, [doi: 10.1016/j.cie.2016.11.019](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cie.2016.11.019).

- [6] Onyeocha, C.E., Wang, J., Khoury, J., Geraghty, J. (2015). A comparison of HK-Conwip and BK-Conwip control strategies in a multi-product manufacturing system, *Operations Research Perspectives*, Vol. 2, 137-149, [doi: 10.1016/j.orp.2015.07.001](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.orp.2015.07.001).
- [7] Renna, P. (2018). BK-Conwip adaptive control strategies in a multi-product manufacturing system, In: Khojasteh, Y. (ed.), *Production Management: Advanced Models, Tools, and Applications for Pull Systems*, CRC Press, Taylor & Francis Group, New York, USA, 45-62, [doi: 10.1201/b21810-3](https://doi.org/10.1201/b21810-3).
- [8] King, D.H., Harrison, H.S. (2013). Open-source simulation software "JaamSim", In: *Proceedings of the 2013 Winter Simulation Conference (WSC)*, Washington, D.C., USA, 2163-2171, [doi: 10.1109/WSC.2013.6721593](https://doi.org/10.1109/WSC.2013.6721593).
- [9] Murino, T., Naviglio, G., Romano, E., Zoppoli, P. (2009). Single stage multi product kanban system. Optimization and parametric analysis, In: *Proceedings of the 8<sup>th</sup> WSEAS International Conference on System Science and Simulation in Engineering*, Genova, Italy, 313-318.
- [10] Piplani, R., Ang, A.W.H. (2018). Performance comparison of multiple product kanban control systems, *International Journal of Production Research*, Vol. 56, No. 3, 1299-1312, [doi: 10.1080/00207543.2017.1332436](https://doi.org/10.1080/00207543.2017.1332436).
- [11] Ezema, C.N., Okafor, E.C., Okezie, C.C. (2017). Kanban based scheduling in a multistage and multiproduct system, *Global Journal of Computer Science and Technology: C Software & Data Engineering*, Vol. 17, No. 1, Version 1, 6-13.
- [12] Olaitan, O.A., Geraghty, J. (2013). Evaluation of production control strategies for negligible-setup, multi-product, serial lines with consideration for robustness, *Journal of Manufacturing Technology Management*, Vol. 24, No. 3, 331-357, [doi: 10.1108/17410381311318864](https://doi.org/10.1108/17410381311318864).
- [13] Onyeocha, C.E., Khoury, J., Geraghty, J. (2015). Evaluation of multi-product lean manufacturing systems with setup and erratic demand, *Computers & Industrial Engineering*, Vol. 87, 465-480, [doi: 10.1016/j.cie.2015.05.029](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cie.2015.05.029).
- [14] Onyeocha, C.E., Khoury, J., Geraghty, J. (2015). Robustness analysis of pull strategies in multi-product systems, *Journal of Industrial Engineering and Management*, Vol. 8, No. 4, 1125-1161, [doi: 10.3926/jiem.1407](https://doi.org/10.3926/jiem.1407).
- [15] Sastry, G.G., Garg, R. (2017). Analysis of single flow line multi stage multi-product pull control systems, *Journal of Scientific & Industrial Research*, Vol. 76, 289-293.
- [16] Krieg, G.N., Kuhn, H. (2008). Performance evaluation of two-stage multi-product kanban systems, *IIE Transactions*, Vol. 40, No. 3, 265-283, [doi: 10.1080/07408170701499554](https://doi.org/10.1080/07408170701499554).
- [17] Yang, S.L., Xu, Z.G., Li, G.Z., Wang, J.Y. (2020). Assembly transport optimization for a reconfigurable flow shop based on a discrete event simulation, *Advances in Production Engineering & Management*, Vol. 15, No. 1, 69-80, [doi: 10.14743/apem2020.1.350](https://doi.org/10.14743/apem2020.1.350).
- [18] Li, G.Z., Xu, Z.G., Yang, S.L., Wang, H.Y., Bai, X.L., Ren, Z.H. (2020). Bottleneck identification and alleviation in a blocked serial production line with discrete event simulation: A case study, *Advances in Production Engineering & Management*, Vol. 15, No. 2, 125-136, [doi: 10.14743/apem2020.2.353](https://doi.org/10.14743/apem2020.2.353).
- [19] Ištoković, D., Perinić, M., Borić, A. (2021). Determining the minimum waiting times in a hybrid flow shop using simulation-optimization approach, *Tehnički Vjesnik - Technical Gazette*, Vol. 28, No. 2, 568-575, [doi: 10.17559/TV-20210216132702](https://doi.org/10.17559/TV-20210216132702).
- [20] Katsios, D., Xanthopoulos, A.S., Koulouriotis, D.E., Kiatipis, A. (2018). A simulation optimisation tool and its production/inventory control application, *International Journal of Simulation Modelling*, Vol. 17, No. 2, 257-270, [doi: 10.2507/IJSIMM17\(2\)425](https://doi.org/10.2507/IJSIMM17(2)425).

# Primerjalna študija različnih vlečnih strategij nadzora pri sistemih za proizvodnjo več vrst izdelkov z uporabo simulacije diskretnih dogodkov

Xanthopoulos, A.S.<sup>a,\*</sup>, Koulouriotis, D.E.<sup>b</sup>

<sup>a,b</sup>Department of Production and Management Engineering, Democritus University of Thrace, V. Sofias 12, Xanthi, Greece

## POVZETEK

Vlečna strategija nadzora proizvodnje usklajuje proizvodne operacije na podlagi dejanskega povpraševanja. Doslej so relevantne publikacije večinoma preučevale proizvodne sisteme, ki proizvajajo eno vrsto izdelka. V tej raziskavi proučujemo vlečne strategije CONWIP, Base Stock in hibridno CONWIP / Kanban v proizvodnih sistemih z več izdelki. V proizvodnem sistemu z več izdelki se z uporabo istih virov proizvaja več vrst izdelkov. Razvijamo omrežne modele čakalnih vrst večstopenjskih proizvodnih sistemov z več izdelki, ki delujejo v skladu s tremi zgoraj omenjenimi strategijami vlečnega nadzora. Simulacijski modeli alternativnih proizvodnih sistemov so zgrajeni z uporabo odprtokodne programske opreme. Primerjalno vrednotenje strategij CONWIP, Base Stock in hibridna CONWIP/Kanban v proizvodnji več izdelkov je izvedeno v seriji simulacijskih eksperimentov z različnimi stopnjami prejema povpraševanja, časi nastavitve in nadzornimi parametri. Strategije nadzora se primerjajo na podlagi povprečnega čakalnega časa za ponovna naročila, povprečnih zalog končnih izdelkov in povprečne dolžine čakalnih vrst za ponovna naročila. Strategija Base Stock je odlična, ko je proizvodni sistem izpostavljen visokim stopnjam prejema povpraševanj. Strategija CONWIP je dosledno zagotavljala najvišjo raven zalog končnega blaga. Na strategijo hibridna CONWIP/Kanban močno vpliva delovna obremenitev sistema.

## PODATKI O ČLANKU

### Ključne besede:

Simulacija diskretnih dogodkov (DES);

Odprtokodna programska oprema;

Programska oprema JaamSim DES;

Proizvodnja več izdelkov;

Večstopenjski proizvodni sistemi;

Strategije vlečnega nadzora proizvodnje

### \*Kontaktna oseba:

[axanthop@pme.duth.gr](mailto:axanthop@pme.duth.gr)

(Xanthopoulos, A.S.)

### Zgodovina članka:

Prejet 17. septembra 2021

Popravljen 30. novembra 2021

Sprejet 3. decembra 2021



Content from this work may be used under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International Licence (CC BY 4.0). Any further distribution of this work must maintain attribution to the author(s) and the title of the work, journal citation and DOI.